I. ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS

1. Dangerous Animal Case: DA 156013 EV
   - Respondent: Scott Leva
   - East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox
   - Complaining Witness: Klary Pucci and Patty Butler

2. Barking Dog Noise Case: BD 156019 EV
   - Respondent: Saul and Gisela Jahaira Gonzalez
   - East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox
   - Complaining Witness: Loren Tarquinio

3. Dangerous Animal Case: DA 153074 WV
   - Respondent: Rhonda and Rogelio Alvarez
   - West Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox
   - Complaining Witness: Michael Daley and Francisco Castro
II. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

1. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD - (Comments from the public on items of public interest within the Board’s subject matter jurisdiction that are not on the Agenda; two minutes per speaker).

Public Comments: The Brown Act prohibits the Board and staff from responding to the speakers' comments. Some of the matters raised in public comment may appear on a future agenda.

2. COMMISSION BUSINESS

A. Board Recognition of LAASEE Award Organization Recipient Home Dog L.A.- Kerry Armstrong (Action Item; Public comment limited to one minute per speaker)

B. Approval of Minutes for the Meeting of April 26, 2016 (Action item; public comment limited to one minute per speaker)

C. Approval of Minutes for the Meeting of May 10, 2016 (Action item; public comment limited to one minute per speaker)

3. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker).

4. COMMISSIONERS’ ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker)

5. BOARD REPORTS

A. Staff Report and Recommendation to Sponsor Pilot Program with K9 Youth Alliance at North Central Shelter for a dog training program for at-risk youth (Action item; public comment limited to two minutes per speaker.)

B. Staff Report and Recommendation to approve use of the Animal Welfare Trust Fund for modifications at the West Valley Animal Shelter to create cat quarantine and isolation areas. (Action item; public comment limited to two minutes per speaker.)

C. Staff Report and Recommendation to approve purchase of email marketing software to use to distribute press releases, updates and news to media, donors, volunteers and the community. (Action item; public comment limited to two minutes per speaker.)

6. DISCUSSION ITEMS

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com
A. Discussion re proposals for increasing accessibility of vouchers following implementation of self-certification policy. (Action item; public comment limited to one minute per speaker.)

7. ADJOURNMENT

Next Regular Meeting is scheduled for 7:00 p.m., June 14, 2016, at Harbor Shelter, 957 N. Gaffey Street, Community Room, San Pedro, California 90731.

AGENDAS - The Board of Animal Services Commissioners (Board) meets regularly every second (2nd) and fourth (4th) Tuesday of each month at 10:00 A.M. Regular Meetings are held at City Hall, 200 North Spring Street, Room 1060, in Los Angeles, CA 90012. Evening Meetings are held in various locations throughout the City, from 7:00 to approximately 9:30 P.M. The agendas for Board meetings contain a brief general description of those items to be considered at the meetings. Board Agendas are available at the Department of Animal Services (Department), Administrative Division, 221 North Figueroa Street, Suite 600, Los Angeles, CA 90012. Board Agendas may also be viewed on the 2nd floor Public Bulletin Board in City Hall East, 200 North Main Street, Los Angeles, CA 90012. Internet users may also access copies of present and prior agenda items, copies of the Board Calendar, MP-3 audio files of meetings as well as electronic copies of approved minutes on the Department’s World Wide Web Home Page site at http://www.laanimalservices.com/CommissionAgendas.htm

Three (3) members of the Board constitute a quorum for the transaction of business. Some items on the Agenda may be approved without any discussion.

The Board Secretary will announce the items to be considered by the Board. The Board will hear the presentation on the topic and gather additional information from Department Staff. Once presentations have finished, the Board President will ask if any Board Member or member of the public wishes to speak on one or more of these items. Each speaker called before the Commission will have one (1) minute to express their comments and concerns on matters placed on the agenda. (For certain agenda items, speakers will have two (2) minutes.)

PUBLIC INPUT AT BOARD MEETINGS – Public Participation on Agenda Items. Members of the public will have an opportunity to address the Board on agenda items after the item is called and before the Board takes action on the item, unless the opportunity for public participation on the item was previously provided to all interested members of the public at a public meeting of a Committee of the Board and the item has not substantially changed since the Committee heard the item. When speaking to an agenda item other than during Public Comment (see Public Comment below), the speaker shall limit his or her comments to the specific item under consideration (California Government Code, Section 54954.3).

Public Comment. The Board will provide an opportunity for public comment at every regular meeting of the Board. Members of the public may address the Board on any items within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Board as part of Public Comment.

Speaker Cards. Members of the public wishing to speak are to fill out one speaker card for each agenda item on which they wish to speak and present it to the Board secretary before the item is called.

Time Limit for Speakers. Speakers addressing the Board will be limited to one (1) minute of speaking time for each agenda item except during general public comment period which is limited to two (2) minutes per speaker. (For certain agenda items, speakers will have two (2) minutes each.) The Chairperson, with the approval of a majority of the Board, may for good cause extend any speaker’s time by increments of up to one (1) minute.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalServices.com
Brown Act. These rules shall be interpreted in a manner that is consistent with the Ralph M. Brown Act, California Government Code Section § 54950 et seq.

STANDARDS OF CONDUCT. Speakers are expected to behave in an orderly manner and to refrain from personal attacks or use of profanity or language that may incite violence.

All persons present at Board meetings are expected to behave in an orderly manner and to refrain from disrupting the meeting, interfering with the rights of others to address the Board and/or interfering with the conduct of business by the Board.

In the event that any speaker does not comply with the foregoing requirements, or if a speaker does not address the specific item under consideration, the speaker may be ruled out of order, their speaking time forfeited and the Chairperson may call upon the next speaker.

The Board, by majority vote, may order the removal from the meeting of any speaker or audience member continuing to behave in a disruptive manner after being warned by the Chairperson regarding their behavior. Section 403 of the California Penal Code states as follows: "Every person who, without authority of law, willfully disturbs or breaks up any assembly or meeting that is not unlawful in its character, other than an assembly or meeting referred to in Section 302 of the Penal Code or Section 18340 of the Elections Code, is guilty of a misdemeanor."

VOTING AND DISPOSITION OF ITEMS – Most items require a majority vote of the entire membership of the Board (3 members). When debate on an item is completed, the Board President will instruct the Secretary to "call the roll". Every member present must vote for or against each item; abstentions are not permitted unless there is a Conflict of Interest for which the Board member is obliged to abstain from voting. The Secretary will announce the votes on each item. Any member of the Board may move to "reconsider" any vote on any item on the agenda, except to adjourn, suspend the Rules, or where an intervening event has deprived the Board of jurisdiction, providing that said member originally voted on the prevailing side of the item. The motion to "reconsider" shall only be in order once during the meeting, and once during the next regular meeting. The member requesting reconsideration shall identify for all members present the Agenda number and subject matter previously voted upon. A motion to reconsider is not debatable and shall require an affirmative vote of three members of the Board.

When the Board has failed by sufficient votes to approve or reject an item, and has not lost jurisdiction over the matter, or has not caused it to be continued beyond the next regular meeting, the issue is again placed on the next agenda for the following meeting for the purpose of allowing the Board to again vote on the matter.
NOTIFICATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL HEARINGS

To Be Held:
Tuesday, May 24, 2016, at 10:00 A.M.

City Hall
200 North Spring Street, 10th Floor, Room 1060
Los Angeles, CA 90012
(Entrance on Main Street)

This serves as formal notice pursuant to Section § 53.18(q) 4 of the Los Angeles Municipal Code (LAMC) to the following parties and witnesses in the appeal(s) listed below:

1. **Dangerous Animal Case: DA 156013 EV**
   Respondent: Scott Leva
   East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox
   Complaining Witness: Klary Pucci and Patty Butler

2. **Barking Dog Noise Case: BD 156019 EV**
   Respondent: Saul and Gisela Jahaira Gonzalez
   East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox
   Complaining Witness: Loren Tarquinio

3. **Dangerous Animal Case: DA 153074 WV**
   Respondent: Rhonda and Rogelio Alvarez
   West Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox
   Complaining Witness: Michael Daley and Francisco Castro

These hearings will not be rescheduled, except for good cause.

As a covered entity under Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act, the City of Los Angeles does not discriminate on the basis of disability and, upon request, will provide reasonable accommodation to ensure equal access to its programs, services and activities. Sign Language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or other auxiliary aids and/or services may be provided upon request. To ensure availability, you are advised to make your request at least 72 hours prior to the meeting you wish to attend.

For additional information, please refer to the Board’s "Rules and Procedures for Appeals", or contact the Department of Animal Services at (213) 482-9558, or visit the Department’s website: [http://www.laanimalservices.com/](http://www.laanimalservices.com/). Written statements are to be submitted to the Commission seven days prior and, if in excess of 50 pages, seven hard copies must be provided. You may submit your statement (50 pages or less) via email to: ani.commission@lacity.org.

Para información en español, llame al (213) 482-9558.
Meeting called to order at 7:11 p.m. Commissioners present were Gross, García and Wolfson. Commissioners Zaft and Yañez were absent. Also present from Los Angeles Animal Services (LAAS) Board Secretary Rita Moreno and General Manager (GM) Brenda Barnette; and Assistant City Attorney (ACA) Dov Lesel.

Commissioner Gross opened the meeting, introduced staff and provided an overview of the meeting agenda. Guillermo Marquez, representing Councilmember Nury Martinez from Council District 6, shared some words and welcomed everyone to the district. Angie Aramayo with Assemblyman Nazarian also shared some words and welcomed everyone to the 46th AD.

REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

1. PUBLIC COMMENT
   Frederick Jordan: ACO with South L.A.; discussed ride along with Mark Salazar; commended work of South L.A. Lt. Smith and recommended promotion; recognized South L.A. volunteers; thanked ASPCA for providing vouchers to spay and neuter animals and medical care. Beverly Mitchell: Former North Central volunteer and LAASEE recipient; told her assistance no longer needed; stated that she has not seen any changes at shelters in relation to volunteers; no notice given to volunteer before animals euthanized. Janel Faraci: Chi Angeles Rescue; discussed new Barkfest show and L.A. City shelter Chihuahuas. Andrew Brown: Discussed making animals “rescue only” from shelters for public safety, because rescues have more experience with challenging animals, and city liability; disagreed with practice. Lisa Edmondson: Discussed Pet Press publication and the resources provided therein. Sherry Brewer: Discussed East Valley shelter’s foster program; recent incidents re yellow mark on kennel cards for dogs that can’t go to fosters; not their fault and dogs not reevaluated. Linda Bassiglieri: Discussed healthy animals killed in 2016; recommended working with non-profit rescues and transport animals to areas where needed/wanted. Gail Raff: East Valley volunteer; thanked fosters for bottle babies and underage kittens; discussed program and class led by Veronica on Sunday; no cats for adoption – cat room has been empty since November; owner surrender room full with “fractious.” Sarah Jane Hardt: Reminded that Kapparat is coming and discussed treatment of chickens; stated animals should not die for religious beliefs. Paul Darrigo: CHULA; discussed the department’s numbers and recommended creating ad-hoc committees to get the work done. Susan Gill: Discussed her concerns with GM Barnette’s tenure. Periel Stanfield: Questioned mobile adoptions allowing only altered animals; feels press release stating L.A. is close to No Kill goal is misleading. Lori Golden: Publisher of Pet Press; discussed misunderstanding about TNR info in publication - 2,000 thrown out. Michael Bell: Requested discussion on media outreach about spay and neuter
vouchers and pet education programs; recommended taking out adds in La Opinion, billboards and Pet Press and targeting South Central, North Central, Panorama City and Sunland; recommended using sterilization fund.

2. COMMISSION BUSINESS

A. Board Recognition of LAASEE Award Organization Recipients (Action Item; Public comment limited to one minute per speaker): *(Item tabled to May 10, 2016)*
   a. Home Dog L.A. (Kerry Armstrong)
   b. NKLA Coalition (Sheila Kouhkan)
   c. ASPCA (Jill Buckley)
   d. Best Friends (Marc Peralta)

B. Approval of Minutes for March 1, 2016.

   Public Comment
   None

   **Commissioner Wolfson** moved to approve the minutes for March 1, 2016 and **Commissioner García** seconded. The motion passed 3 - 0.

C. Approval of Minutes for March 22, 2016.

   Public Comment
   None

   **Commissioner García** moved to approve the minutes for March 22, 2016 and **Commissioner Wolfson** seconded. The motion passed 3 - 0.

D. Approval of Minutes for April 12, 2016.

   Public Comment
   None

   **Commissioner Gross** moved to amend and approve the minutes for April 12, 2016 with correction under Administrative Appeals to change “taken out of order after II.4” change to “…II.1”; and **Commissioner Wolfson** seconded. The motion passed 3 - 0.

3. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER

   **GM Barnette** discussed the following:

   - Department budget recommended by Mayor includes funding for EIR to lift the injunction against spaying and neutering stray cats; being considered on Thursday.
   - April 20 – PAW Committee approved proposal to increase the monetary value of discount and free spay neuter certificates for dogs and rabbits.
   - April 13, 18, 19, 20 – strategic planning meetings held in Council Districts 7, 6, 5 and 3; discussed process and providing input online.
   - PetCo’s Porter Ranch store will have cats for adoption; training this week.

   Please join us at our website: [www.LAAnimalservices.com](http://www.LAAnimalservices.com)
• “Lucky Dogs” season four with trainer Brandon McMillan – will be adopting dogs from six shelters to feature on show.
• Cmdr. Dedeaux and Robert Cabral, ED of Bound Angels, held shelter rescue support class for animal care professionals from Tennessee, Northern California and Arizona and volunteers on how to identify canine behaviors using safe animal handling skills; effort geared to increase adoptions.
• ACO positions; 113 eligible candidates with half in the background check process; last budget cycle approved filling eight vacancies, plus 12 and 12 unfunded positions that are in the budget this year to be funded.
• April 27 next strategic planning meeting in CD 12; upcoming meetings on May 3, 4, 10, 11 and 17.
• April 25 – Kirk O’ the Valley School Humane Education Day from 9:00 AM to 12:00 PM at 19620 Vanowen St.; West Valley staff will attend.
• April 27 – Open orientation for volunteers
• Field Operations
  o April 14 – ACOs assisted Gas Company with dogs at several locations for unpaid bills.
  o April 15 – ACO responded to Kennedy H.S. for mountain lion sighting; Fish & Wildlife tranquilized animal and released in Santa Susana Mountains.
  o April 11 – LAPD reported dog shot with pellet gun; dog died; Animal Cruelty Task Force investigating and filing felony animal abuse charges with District Attorney.
  o April 5 – Chesterfield Square Center ACOs responded to call from man cornered by two large dogs and trying to protect own dog; dogs impounded.
  o March 31 – Port Police call to Harbor shelter to assist with two aggressive pit bulls hampering film production; another call a few days later at the Cabrillo Marine Museum for same dogs aggressive toward adults and children; animals impounded.
  o April 3 – Animal hospital reported stabbed dog; ACO impounded and found out dog tried to defend owner, who was also stabbed and taken to hospital; suspect arrested and dog recovering.
• April 12 – Daniel Pearl Magnet School visited staff and pets at East Valley shelter; discussed pet adoptions and photographed adoptable pets for school project.
• American Red Cross requested assistance for cats owned by woman who lost home due to fire; “Velcro” and five kittens being cared for at North Central until woman has a home.
• Recognized Department Veterinarians; performed rare surgery on dog with congenital chest muscle deformity; dog recovering at South L.A.

Public Comment
Phyllis Daugherty: Requested that reports address what is happening at shelters with violence; stated that a fight had occurred at North Central shelter parking lot – man in wheelchair assaulted; man at East Valley shelter with knife trying to stab dogs; asked about policy on safety for safety; lighting at North Central inadequate; asked if case with stabbed dog being filed as animal cruelty. Paul Darrigo: CHULA; discussed need for collaboration between department and volunteers; no need to go to NCs when volunteers have been giving input. Susan Gill: Unhappy with General Manager’s performance. Beverly Mitchell: Stated that department vets are operating on dogs

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com
that are sick, over eight years old and need blood work – dogs then near dead and put on medical alert; reprimanded for taking sick dog to medical; security cameras need to be installed; falsely accused of accosting Ms Ferachi’s driver. Gail Raff: Commended East Valley Staff and volunteers (Commissioner Gross agreed). Periel Stanfield: Recommended security cameras and webcams, more video integration to show animals and euthanasia. Michael Bell: Agreed with security cameras; stated that there is an ACO with background in training dogs, but denied opportunity to apply his trade. Andrew Brown: Stated East Valley shelter cleared rabbit room and thanked department for rabbit cages (GM Barnette clarified that Michelle Kelly and her donors provided the cages). Jacob Miller: ACT for almost 15 years; stated that East Valley has security cameras; also important are the intercom and security doors; was one of first responders when ACO was shot. (Commissioner Gross recognized ACTs, ACOs and Volunteers). Frederick Jordan: Stated that no one should have to pay for spay or neuter; would like to take volunteers to pass out vouchers; thanked ASPCA and would like them to take over the Harbor clinic. Lori Golden: Stated she receives emails from people who want to adopt animals being held for Best Friends' events; ability to ask ACT or Supervisor to allow adoption should be publicized.

4. COMMISSIONERS’ ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Wolfson: Invited public to visit his facebook page to view list of items he is requesting on future agendas such as research to see what it takes to issue an RFP to sell pet supplies in shelters, waiting for report back on pilot program changing hours at one shelter to meet community needs, increasing evening meetings held in community, ideas to increase licensing, examining managed admissions; financial incentive for foster program, establishing a uniform care of bunnies, and consideration of a gift policy; would like to know what we can do for volunteers.

Commissioner Garcia: Thanked everyone for attending and ACT Jacob Miller for facility tour.

Commissioner Gross: Attended the last four strategic planning meetings held in Pacoima, Van Nuys, Encino and Reseda; Councilmember Blumenfield attended the Reseda meeting in CD3; meeting tomorrow night in CD12 in the Community Service Center in Chatsworth, and on Thursday in Echo Park; online survey for input at: http://bit.ly/laas-survey; thanked everyone for attending meeting tonight.

Public Comment

Andrew Brown: Asked if rabbits are available for foster. Gail Raff: Recommended allowing fosters to adopt free of charge; asked about people who can’t afford to surrender animals and dump then on the street. Periel Stanfield: Stated that animals are reserved for adoption events instead of being adopted or taken by rescues. Frederick Jordan: Acknowledged Lisa Edmondson for taking care of rabbits; thanked Commissioner Wolfson for volunteer work at North Central, and invited all Commissioners to volunteer and participate in ride-along with Officers. Paul Darrigo: CHULA; stated that there is a function in Chameleon to do emails for licensing; IP (interested parties) for animals don’t get calls – they should be sent emails when animals are available; contact Riverside - they are beta testers. Phyllis Daugherty: Stated that with past attempts to foster baby bunnies, they have died; because they are very sensitive and fragile; Michelle has better way of working with people who want to adopt bunnies.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalServices.com
5. BOARD REPORTS

A. Animal Welfare Trust and Animal Sterilization Fund Balances

GM Barnette opened for questions; working on the affidavit for self-identification for the free spay neuter vouchers; went to PAW Committee and City Council.

Commissioner Wolfson asked about the $203,814.65 amount for shelter security cameras in the Animal Welfare Trust Fund; GM Barnette responded that money was approved for cameras by Commissioners; cameras purchased through city vendor RD Systems; not sure if all have been installed – can have update at future meeting. Commissioner Gross asked about the spay and neuter numbers for Lucy Pet Foundation (GM Barnette responded that they have just started and they don’t charge for everything); asked about five different categories for Spay4LA and no billing (GM Barnette responded that they have two vans; will send reminder to them).

Public Comment

Gail Raff: Asked about the new trucks (GM Barnette responded they came in and went back for bad brakes).

B. WoofStat Report for March 2016

GM Barnette provided an overview of the report; cat live save rate is up 12% shelter wide; website search shows how many dogs, cats and other animals (excluding rabbits) are available; 22% increase in the sale of dog licenses – probably means animal has been spayed or neutered – acknowledged Licensing Team and ACE citations (Commissioner Gross noted 3,800 citations had been issued; GM Barnette clarified they are not all for licensing); overall euthanasia down 25% - cats are down 21% and dogs 30% - due to 243 New Hope Partners and help from Best Friends and ASPCA, and staff; volunteers are up 28% this month to 4,985 and volunteer hours are up 26%; foster program languishing; talking about all shelters doing 4th of July blitz as promoted by East Valley last year; monitoring contract vets to ensure getting the number of surgeries; CPRA requests up 78%; hearings are up 121% this month, 141% YTD.

Commissioner Wolfson noted that East Valley is one of the most improved shelters - dog numbers are at 92.96%; stated that numbers don’t tell the whole truth, but it’s good to see trends; noted improvement from Harbor shelter and asked about lessons learned that can benefit South L.A. that is moving in opposite direction. GM Barnette responded that a lot of animals come in to South L.A., but there is not a lot of foot traffic; most animals that leave the shelter are transferred to other shelters. Commissioner Wolfson noted that Harbor is the most improved and asked what was learned there. GM Barnette responded that Harbor shelter is like a community and have a solid core of volunteers, and have Pedro Pet Pals. Commissioner Wolfson asked about spay neuter and vouchers. GM Barnette responded that there have been some major impound cases, one involving 15 dogs, 5 cats and 30 birds – vets needs to examine each so it takes them away from spay neuter, but sending them out to outside vets; will have Chief Vet come to speak on spay and neuter. Commissioner Wolfson asked about volunteer hours; recommended a mediation system to work with volunteers. GM Barnette

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com
responded that there is a mediation system. **Commissioner Gross** stated need for volunteer coordinator to serve as liaison between volunteers and staff. **GM Barnette** responded that position requested is not going to be funded, so will ask for unfunded position; if City Attorney determines it is appropriate within the AWTF, will ask Commission to fund it for a year, then request city funding going forward. **Commissioner Wolfson** stated that he has been requesting the position for some time; will support funding. **Commissioner Garcia** asked which shelters have pre-intake counseling. **GM Barnette** responded that intervention groups are at East Valley, South L.A. and North Central. **Commissioner Garcia** asked if an impact on the live save rates has been noted. **GM Barnette** responded that intervention groups keep statistics themselves on how many they help; can't claim their numbers. **Commissioner Gross** noted that redemption of $30 vouchers is up, but $70 vouchers are down. **GM Barnette** responded they can be up to 60 days in arrears so numbers are difficult to study. **Commissioner Gross** asked if appeals can be included to track their number (**GM Barnette** responded she will ask Dara to put in another line in report); noted the 296 requests for hearings and asked about staff's ability to respond. **GM Barnette** responded the number corresponds to those that have been heard, not the ones that are waiting; requests are a couple of months backlogged.

Public Comment  
**Jacob Miller:** Acknowledged Dr. White and her work; stated he has taken the lead serving as volunteer liaison; added that union SEIU Local 721, bargaining unit 4 requested six positions, one for each shelter to have a New Hope Coordinator and Volunteer Liaison for a small bump in pay; best animals at East Valley – like Trader Joe’s, people leave with something. **Gail Raff:** Stated that cats are down, because they have none; questioned the number of volunteers – needs volunteers for cats; Rescue Train needs money for outside Vets. **Frederick Jordan:** Stated that it takes a lot of time to write out ACE citation; suggested adding codes and violations with check-off boxes – write up and investigation takes more than an hour now; recognized East Valley Officer Raquel Sheldon. **Paul Darrigo:** CHULA; recommend looking at volunteer training – coaching and support needs to take place early on – should develop a program to train staff to train volunteers; asked if it is legal for staff to bring in own animals for surgery. **Andrew Brown:** Discussed volunteer firings – noted different culture at different shelters; recommended conflict resolution; stated that Volunteer Coordinator is a safety issue – volunteers being trained by volunteer with only months experience on handling animals.

6. **ADJOURNMENT**

**Commissioner Garcia** made a motion to adjourn and **Commissioner Wolfson** seconded. Motion passed 3 - 0.

Meeting ended at 9:04 p.m.

Please join us at our website: [www.LAAnimalservices.com](http://www.LAAnimalservices.com)
BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS
CITY OF LOS ANGELES

MINUTES
TUESDAY, May 10, 2016 at 10:00 AM

LOS ANGELES CITY HALL, ROOM 1060
200 NORTH SPRING STREET
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90012

Audio MP-3 Recording is available at www.laanimalservices.com

David Zaft, President
Larry Gross, Vice-President
Olivia E. Garcia
Roger Wolfson
Alana Yañez

Meeting called to order at 10:06 a.m. Commissioners present were Zaft, Gross, García and Wolfson. Commissioner Yañez was absent. Also present from Los Angeles Animal Services (LAAS) Board Secretary Rita Moreno, General Manager (GM) Brenda Barnette; and Assistant City Attorney (ACA) Dov Lesel.

Commissioner Zaft opened the meeting and provided an overview of the meeting agenda. Commissioner Zaft also announced that the community outreach meetings for the strategic plan were continuing and invited community members to participate. Lastly, Commissioner Zaft announced that this would be the last meeting for Board Secretary Moreno. She has accepted another position in another City department. He thanked Ms. Moreno for her service and dedication to the Board during her tenure. Commissioner Gross discussed the appeal hearing process prior to conducting the hearings.

I. ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS (taken out of order after item II.1.)

1. Dangerous Animal Case: DA 153038 WL
   Respondent: Mark R. Lewis
   Complaining Witness: Jill Crusenberry, Arnold Kessler, Jennifer Botte, Greg Wilk
   West Los Angeles Animal Care and Control: Captain Wendell Bowers

   Testimony was provided by the Respondent, Mark Lewis, and his Attorney, David Mann, stating that the dog "Mel" has participated in training and will wear a muzzle in public. The Complaining Witness, Jill Crusenberry, and her husband testified that the neighborhood is not safe with Mel around due to Mr. Lewis' unwillingness and inability to control the dog. The Commissioners asked questions and discussed the merits of the appeal and the evidence provided to the Hearing Examiner.

   Commissioner Zaft found that there was not testimony supporting the appeal and moved to uphold the General Manager's determination to revoke the dog license for Mel (L17-248683; A0957417); and the Respondent's privilege to own, possess, control or be in charge of any dog for a period of three years. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garcia and was approved by a vote of 4 - 0.

II. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

1. PUBLIC COMMENT (taken out of order before item l.1.)
   Phyllis Daugherty: Discussed the new GMC truck that carries 6 officers and very few animals. Stated that the truck is designed for SMART team and is of poor quality. Also referenced an email between Mark Salazar and Jesse Castillo regarding public
perception and employee morale. **Dan Guss:** Submitted two articles "No Kill: LA’s Big Lie" and "Duped Councilman Rationalizes Mayor’s Animal Bamboozle" **Michael Bell:** Commented on truck WLA shelter has that doesn’t have air conditioning but forced air. Discussed upcoming hot weather and the effect on the animals. Says vehicles must have air conditioning for the animals.

2. **COMMISSION BUSINESS** *(taken out of order after item I.1.)*

A. Board Recognition of LAASEE Award Organization Recipients
   1. Home Dog L.A. (Kerry Armstrong) *(tabled to next meeting)*
   2. NKLA Coalition (Sheila Kouhkan)
   3. ASPCA (Jill Buckley)
   4. Best Friends (Marc Peralta) *(tabled to future meeting)*

Commissioner Wolfson and gave a summary of the purpose of the LAASEE Award. Commissioner Zaft shared information about his nominee, the NKLA Coalition, and the importance and impact of its work in Los Angeles, and presented Sheila Kouhkan, accepting on behalf of the NKLA Coalition, with the award. Sheila Kouhkan thanked the Commission and discussed the NKLA Coalition.

Commissioner Gross shared information about the grant funding support provided by his nominee, the ASPCA, to support the adoption of shelter animals and other department goals and presented Jill Buckley of the ASPCA with the award. Jill Buckley thanked the Commission and discussed the organization’s work in support of Los Angeles’ shelter and public animals.

Public Comment
**Jessica Lopez:** SNPLA stated that they are grateful for being able to assist. Thankful also for the grant from Best Friends.

Commissioner Gross moved to award the LAASEE Award to the NKLA Coalition and the ASPCA, and Commissioner Wolfson seconded. The motion passed 4-0.

B. Approval of Minutes for April 26, 2016. *(tabled to next meeting)*

Public Comment
None

3. **ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER**

**GM Barnette** discussed the following:

- The Mayor’s Proposed Budget for 2016-17 is being considered by the Budget and Finance Committee. The Department still has issues pending such as the funding for as-needed (part-time employees) and the addition of key administrative staff positions. The Committee will have final deliberations at the end of the week.
- Community meetings for the strategic planning process have been enlightening. Encouraged those who have not attended to do so.
- During the last Commission meeting that was held at East Valley, there was a large bust where a number of animals were taken in including birds, dogs, cats,

Please join us at our website: [www.LAAnimalservices.com](http://www.LAAnimalservices.com)
etc.
  • There was a raid of a home of and the acquisition of 60 dogs.

Public Comment
Phyllis Daugherty: Made a statement regarding the van costing $76,000 being used for the SMART team. Stated that she will address the matter during the Fleet Comment portion.

4. COMMISSIONERS’ ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Gross: Attended four strategic planning meetings. Found that meetings presented very informative, creative ideas. Discussed overcrowding issue at East Valley shelter and the favorable public response to the issue.

Commissioner Zaft: Mentioned future strategic community planning meetings.

Commissioner Garcia: Stated her intention to attend future strategic planning meetings

Commissioner Wolfson: Discussed having kiosks in the shelters to sell products. Suggested that shelter staff ask owners to appoint a godparent in advance for each animal. Mentioned streamlining gift process for large donations

Public Comment
None

5. BOARD REPORTS

A. Update from Contract Spay/Neuter Clinics at Shelters, Operated by ASPCA and ValueVet

Jennifer Anderson from ASPCA provided a report and showed a slide presentation. Explained close relationship with SLA shelter. Commended shelter staff and described the services rendered at the shelter. Ms. Anderson gave statistics for the number of surgeries done at the shelter and at the mobile clinic. Specifically the breakdown provided was 57% public, 17% adoptions, 13% pre-adoptions, 10% rescue groups. ASPCA has focused on the 90003 zip code and reported on the importance of transportation to and from clinic. Third team is scheduled to be added this month. There is a goal of 12,000 surgeries this year. They are currently at 4,000 surgeries which is on track toward the 12,000 goal. They are working with canvassers in North Central so that they have information to provide to the constituents who may need their services. They are looking forward to the canvassing efforts growing in South Los Angeles.

Commissioner Gross asked about number of surgeries. Asked question about the 3,406 in first year. Asked if this number was number projected or less. Less than anticipated per Jennifer Anderson.

Commissioner Gross questioned the length of the contract and the outreach to the community. Asked about trouble spending $500K grant. Asked about services rendered from grant funds.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com
Representative from ValueVet (no name stated for the record) provided a report that described the services that are available seven days a week. Discussed types of services provided. 2015 spay/neuter totals given.

Commissioner Wolfson asked if ValueVet requested licenses for animals prior to providing services for animals. Asked that ValueVet work to inform citizens of the need to inform to obtain licenses. Reminded them of the opportunity to make a small profit on selling licenses on behalf of the City.

Commissioner Garcia asked if animal sees a doctor prior to the low cost vaccination. It was explained by ValueVet that a doctor sees each animal and the exam fee is waived.

Commissioner Zaft asked about the work flow on the on the requests to alter shelter animals (pre-spays). ValueVet indicated that the work flow is smooth.

Commissioner Gross asked about goals for spay/neuter. Asked if the goal was reached. ValueVet representative stated that there is not a goal set. Numbers depend completely on volume.

Public Comment
Phyllis Daugherty: Stated that she's very grateful for Value Vet. Concerned about the self-identification process for free spay/neuter certificates to make sure the animal are City animals. Also concerned about the proper use of vouchers.

B. Staff Report on Status of Fleet, Allocation and Modifications

DFO Mark Salazar and Richard Coulson from General Services provided an oral report stating the status of the fleet vehicles. Five meetings held since last report to the Board in September 2015. Discussion of procedures completed to cool the vans. Actual cost is $2140 per vehicle. Status of each vehicle presented. Clarification made that the trucks are for the field not the SMART team. Expressed the fact that staff complained that vehicles are too long and too high. Reported that 10 vehicles were requested in next year’s proposed budget but was not approved.

Commissioner Wolfson asked what we anticipate the public comments will be regarding this item.

Commissioner Gross asked DFO Salazar to speak to concerns of public in advance regarding trucks. Requested his opinion on the debate between forced airflow versus air conditioning. Air conditioning will have ensure that animals don't die. Discussion about new officers and the number of vehicles available.

Public Comment
Phyllis Daugherty: Expressed additional concern regarding vehicle design. Showed picture of what vehicles should look like. Wanted City to contact Custom Coach and consult them for design input. Michael Bell: Expressed concern regarding vehicles. Wanted more clarification about testing. Plead to have more done more testing regarding the vehicles. Vehicles in the past worked very well.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalServices.com
Commissioner Zaft asked to have the bidding process explained for the benefit of the Board. Richard Coulson of GSD described the bidding process in detail.

Commissioner Zaft asked about the number of bids received and whether Animal Services were consulted about the bids.

C. Request to Negotiate and Enter into Contract Agreement with Spay Neuter Project of Los Angeles (SNPLA) for Operation of the East Valley Spay/Neuter Clinic

Sr. Mail John Forland provided an overview of the staff report and responded to questions.

Commissioner Zaft asked about the typical contract length and renewals. This contract is a one year contract with several one year renewals.

Public Comment
None

Commissioner Gross moved to approve staff recommendation to enter into a contract agreement with Spay Neuter Project Los Angeles (SNPLA) for operation of the East Valley spay/neuter clinic, and Commissioner Garcia seconded. The motion passed 4 – 0.

6. DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Proposal from Commissioner Wolfson to Consider Increasing the Number of Evening Board Meetings Held at Animal Services Shelters

Commissioner Wolfson discussed his proposal that the number of night meetings be increased.

Commissioner Zaft stated seven meeting out of 23 are held at night. Night meetings place an additional burden on staff. Felt that it's counter-productive to listen to appeals at evening meetings.

GM Barnette commented about the additional burden on staff and additional costs in overtime pay. Night meetings generally have the same people attend over and over.

Public Comment
Phyllis Daugherty: Stated the public's view of the animal shelters. Felt as though there was no reason for public to attend meetings. Stated that she only attends because of the work she's involved in. Michael Bell: Stated that most of the public are not available to attend day meetings. Suggested that the board handle issues that involve the public during evening meetings.

B. Proposal by Commissioner Zaft to Develop Spay Neuter Public Education Program

Commissioner Zaft discussed his proposal to raise public awareness to spay/neuter their animals. Governing Statute for the of Animal Sterilization Fund authorizes board to use Animal Sterilization money for public education about

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com
spay/neuter. Suggested that we use a fraction of the money for that purpose.

**GM Barnette:** Discussed Sara Ebrahimi’s role in the department as Public Relations Specialist II. Ms. Barnette asked Sara to prepare on overall marketing plan in June for the department to present to the commission. Will work on a marketing report that will show the number of hits for each piece of outreach. Goal is to have a comprehensive monthly report and a long range plan.

**Public Comment**

**Jessica Lopez:** Affirmed SNPLA’s support of outreach program for spay/neuter. They also travel to elementary school and community colleges with information and resources. Public is not aware of all the resources available. **Michael Bell:** CHULA; stated that Garfield and friends is willing to allow the department to use characters for spay/neuter program specifically directed toward hispanic population. Gave costs of media blitz. **Phyllis Daugherty:** Stated repetition sells spay/neuter. Suggested a 311 number. Consistency is very important. Public doesn’t know when or how spay/neuter program works.

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

**Commissioner Wolfson** made a motion to adjourn in honor of department Board Secretary Rita Moreno. **Commissioner Zaft** seconded. Motion passed 4 - 0.

Meeting ended at 1:19 p.m.
Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners

MEETING DATE: May 24, 2016        PREPARED BY: Brenda Barnette

REPORT DATE: May 19, 2016        TITLE: General Manager

SUBJECT: RECOMMENDATION TO SPONSOR PILOT PROGRAM WITH K9 YOUTH
ALLIANCE AT NORTH CENTRAL ANIMAL SHELTER FOR A DOG TRAINING
PROGRAM FOR AT-RISK YOUTH

BOARD ACTIONS RECOMMENDED:

- APPROVE the recommendation to sponsor a pilot program at North Central
  Shelter with K9 Youth Alliance for at risk youth.

BACKGROUND:

K9 Youth Alliance (K9YA) Mission enriches the lives of vulnerable teens and prepares
abandoned dogs for permanent homes.

K9YA partners with local youth service providers and animal shelters to bring
underserved teens and homeless dogs together for experience-based learning and
enrichment.

K9YA students develop important life skills and build transformative bonds with their
canine partners, their peers and our staff. K9YA dogs learn basic behaviors and receive
much-needed socialization that reduces stress, helps them impress potential adopters,
and eases their transition to a permanent home.

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

Visit our website at www.LAAnimalServices.com
Each program serves six teens and an average of six dogs. Program sessions run for three weeks, five days a week, two hours a day. During the first hour of each day, students, supported by staff members, train their canine partners in the field. During the second hour, students, dogs and staff settle into the classroom to work on activities together. Each program culminates in a “public” graduation ceremony where students give a brief presentation and run their dogs through a short agility course. K9YA then holds monthly check-ins with former students to sustain connections and provide ongoing support.

Attached is the K9 Youth Alliance Prospectus.

FISCAL IMPACT:

None

Approved:

Brenda Barnette, General Manager

Attachment

BOARD ACTION:

_______ Passed

_______ Disapproved

_______ Passed with noted modifications

_______ Continued

_______ Tabled

_______ New Date
K9 Youth Alliance

"Kids helping dogs helping kids."

Louis was struggling, on the verge of being kicked out of high school, ashamed because his family was poor, and lonely because he felt like no one understood what it was like for him at home. Nine-year old Canine #OS457 was struggling too, terrified and confused from the moment her human family left her at the animal shelter because “they had a new puppy now.” What each of them didn’t know was that meeting one another would soon make all the difference in their world.

We’ve seen something remarkable happen when kids and dogs work together, and we seek to empower kids like Louis and dogs like Canine #OS457 (let’s rename her Sadie) to help each other build trust, confidence and hope that lasts.

The Model

Our Mission - enrich the lives of vulnerable teens and prepare abandoned dogs for permanent homes.

K9 Youth Alliance (K9YA) partners with local youth service providers and animal shelters to bring disadvantaged teens and homeless dogs together for experience-based learning and enrichment.

K9YA students develop important life skills and build transformative bonds with their canine partners, their peers and our staff. K9YA dogs learn basic behaviors and receive much-needed socialization that reduces stress, helps them impress potential adopters and eases their transition to a permanent home.

Each program serves six teens and an average of six dogs. Program sessions run for three weeks, five days a week, two hours a day. During the first hour of each day, students, supported by staff members, train their canine partners in the field; during the second hour, students, dogs and staff settle into the classroom to work on activities together. Each program culminates in a “public” graduation ceremony, where students give a brief presentation and run their dogs through a short agility course. K9YA then holds monthly check-ins with former students to sustain connections and provide ongoing support.
Why We Do It

Teen Risks – Building Resilience

Source: Survey of LA County high school students (2013) - Center for Disease Control

- Within the last month: 28% drank alcohol, while 13% reported binge drinking
- Within the last year: 22% were in a physical fight, and 28% reported feeling sad and hopeless for two straight weeks

Source: US Census (2013)
- 17% of children under 18 in Pasadena live below the federal poverty threshold

Source: CA Department of Education (2013)
- Roughly 263 PUSD high school students dropped out during the school year
- Of these, 68% were Hispanic/Latino, and 20% were African American
- PUSD saw a high school truancy rate of about 22%.

The data suggests that the stakes are high for all young people, but for teens burdened with overwhelming challenges like poverty, trauma and neglect, the stakes are even greater. Youth from at-risk backgrounds are more likely to suffer long-term consequences such as academic failure, addiction, joblessness and unplanned pregnancy.

K9YA provides marginalized teens with the chance to make a very real difference in a shelter dog’s life. For many of the students in the program, it may be the first time they’ve felt like someone depends on them; the first time they’ve felt like they matter. Our students become empowered, and begin to develop important internal resources like enhanced self-confidence, resilience and a positive mind-set.

Shelter Dogs – Increasing Their Chances

Abandoned dogs in Los Angeles County face a challenging reality. Animal shelters are confusing, chaotic places for dogs. Many adapt to their new environment with difficulty and develop the kinds of behavioral problems that scare off potential adopters.

Canine behavior problems, pet overpopulation and uninformed pet owners are some of the main reasons our shelters are full. K9YA addresses these issues by providing shelter dogs with regular enrichment, exercise, force-free training and opportunities to eliminate outside of the kennel. What’s more, our student curriculum builds awareness about dog safety, humane treatment and the importance spaying and neutering pets. Canine stress levels go down, pro-social canine behaviors emerge, future pet owners become informed and there are fewer homeless pets in our shelters.

When

We plan to launch the first of two pilot programs in February 2016, and hold up to five full programs throughout the remainder of the year.
Where
K9 Youth Alliance serves disadvantaged communities in the greater Pasadena area. Program sessions are held on location, either at youth service providers or shelters, according to the logistics of the program and the needs of our partners.

Who Are We
K9 Youth Alliance is a 501(c)3 nonprofit based in Pasadena. We are a small, grassroots organization of individuals who believe that every kid and every dog deserve the opportunity to thrive. We are a start-up, but we are not starting from scratch. We are mentored by and modeled after a proven model, k9 connection, an organization that has helped over 650 teens and 425 dogs in West Los Angeles.

***
REPORT TO THE BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS

MEETING DATE: May 24, 2016
PREPARED BY: Derek Brown

REPORT DATE: May 19, 2016
TITLE: Assistant General Manager, Operations

SUBJECT: USE OF ANIMAL WELFARE TRUST FUND FOR IMPROVEMENTS AT WEST VALLEY ANIMAL SHELTER

BOARD ACTIONS RECOMMENDED:

- APPROVE the use of Animal Welfare Trust Fund monies for the construction costs associated with creating a quarantine room and a separate isolation room for cats at the West Valley Animal Shelter.

SUMMARY:

The West Valley Animal Shelter is currently under construction making capital improvements to the facility, including an upgraded medical facility. The planning process for this project took place over many years and is funded through Proposition F. The initial Phase I plans for the project included both an isolation room and a separate quarantine room for cats. Separate quarantine areas are required by state law to observe and separate rabies-suspect animals. Isolation rooms are used to separate sick and injured animals from the general population. This helps to prevent cross-infection and creates a quiet space for animals to convalesce.

BACKGROUND:

The initial scope of work in Phase I included the cat isolation and quarantine rooms. Over several years and through the various project management participants, these

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

Visit our website at www.LAAnimalServices.com
rooms were unintentionally eliminated from Phase I construction. Both rooms are important elements of the medical facility improvements. Cats are subjected to diseases that are highly contagious and may be fatal. Kittens and unvaccinated cats are particularly susceptible to these diseases and our shelter system receives many young and unvaccinated cats.

Solution: To create two separate areas by constructing a dividing wall. This modification will improve animal health and safety at the West Valley Shelter. The designated area is currently under construction and this would be the opportune time to create a dividing wall.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The Department has received the attached estimate from the Department of General Services Construction Forces Division for the construction costs associated with this project. According to the estimate, the cost for enclosing the area and separating the two rooms is approximately $15,290.

The total fiscal impact to the Animal Welfare Trust Fund is approximately $18,348. This includes a 20% contingency amount.

Approved:

Brenda Barnette, General Manager

Attachment

BOARD ACTION:

Passed
Disapproved

Passed with noted modifications
Continued

Tabled
New Date
DEPARTMENT OF GENERAL SERVICES
CONSTRUCTION FORCES DIVISION
REQUEST for CHANGE ORDER

DATE: 5/19/16
TO: Alan Espiritu
TITLE: Project Manager
PHONE #: 
FAX #: 

CHANGE ORDER #: 012
REPLY TO: Jeff Rosas
TITLE: C & M SUPV
PHONE #: (213) 473-7818
FAX #: 

PROJECT TITLE: W Valley Animal Services

WORK ORDER #: A4390012  BLDG #: 7/6  RFI REFERENCE #: N/A
PLAN #: N/A  PLAN DATE: N/A  SHEET #: N/A  DETAIL #: N/A  CRAFT: 375&374

TYPE: ☐ PCO  ☐ ECO  ☑ T&MCO

CATEGORY: ☐ 1  ☐ 2  ☑ 3  ☐ 4

Reason for change: Not in original scope of work.


3. ESTIMATED COST OF CHANGE: $15,290

Jeffrey Sgambarbiline
WRITTEN BY

4. NUMBER OF DAYS ADDED TO PROJECT BECAUSE OF CHANGE:

5. ACTUAL COST OF CHANGE ORDER:

Jeff Rosas
CRAFT SUPERVISOR

5/19/16

SUBMITTED BY: Jeff Rosas
C&M SUPERVISOR

5/19/16

REQUESTING DEPARTMENT

I hereby authorize GSD to perform the work specified in this Change Order. The Department agrees to provide GSD with funding as necessary, to cover the cost of this Change Order. Actual costs may be more or less than the estimated amount.

AUTHORIZED APPROVAL BY:

PRINT NAME

TITLE

SIGNATURE

DATE

APPROVED BY:

CONSTRUCTION DIVISION PROGRAM SUPERINTENDENT

DATE

Types:
PCO  Preliminary Change Order
ECO  Emergency Change Order
T&MCO  Time & Material Change Order

Categories:
1. Changed/Unforeseen Conditions
2. Errors & Omissions
3. Changes in Scope
4. Underestimated/Omitted in Estimate

T:\AI Proj Doc\A439 BOE W VALLEY ANI SHELTER PH II\05 Change Orders\Drafts\CO 012 - New walls & soffits between cats room A112 & A113. Mud, tape & paint...doc
**DEPARTMENT OF GENERAL SERVICES**  
**CONSTRUCTION FORCES DIVISION**  
**CHANGE ORDER ESTIMATE**

**DATE:**  5/19/2016  
**W.O. #**  A4390012  
**C.O. #**  012

**TO:**  Alan Espiritu  
**C&M:**  Jeff Rosas

**FROM:**  Kelly Cooper, BC&M Gen Supt. II  
**PREPARED BY:**  Jeffrey Sgambellone

**BLDG NAME:**  West Valley Animal Shelter  
**BLDG.**  7/6

**PLAN #:**  N/A  
**PLAN DATE:**  N/A  
**DATE REC'D:**  N/A

**PROJECT TITLE:**  BOE W VALLEY ANI SHELTER PH II

**SCOPE OF WORK:**  New walls & soffits between cat rooms A112 & A113. Mud, tape & paint.

**NOT IN SCOPE OF WORK:**  Plans, Permits, Electrical, HVAC, Plumbing & or anything not mentioned in the above scope work.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CFT</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION OF WORK</th>
<th>LABOR HOURS</th>
<th>LABOR</th>
<th>MATERIAL OR SUB-CONT</th>
<th>COMMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Frame wall &amp; build sifits</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>$7,400</td>
<td>$2,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>374</td>
<td>Mud, tape &amp; paint.</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>$4,800</td>
<td>$450</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Supervision</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>$247</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Estimating</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>$123</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTALS:**  $12,570  
**MATERIAL TOTAL:**  $2,450

**LABOR TOTAL:**  $12,570

**ESTIMATE TOTAL:**  $15,290

---

**Important Note:** GSD provides construction services on a "Time and Material" basis, and all cost over the estimate must be covered by the project budget.

---

**CO 012 -** New walls & soffits between cat room A112 & A113. Mud, tape & paint.
Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners

MEETING DATE: May 24, 2016

REPORT DATE: May 18, 2016

SUBJECT: REQUEST TO PURCHASE EMAIL MARKETING SOFTWARE TO SEND OUT PRESS RELEASES, UPDATES AND NEWS TO MEDIA, DONORS, VOLUNTEERS AND THE COMMUNITY

PREPARED BY: Sara Ebrahim

TITLE: Public Relations Specialist

BOARD ACTION RECOMMENDED:

1. AUTHORIZE the General Manager of the Department of Animal Services, or designee, to purchase email marketing software according to general terms described in this Board Report.

2. DIRECT staff to transmit the approved Agreement to the Office of the Mayor and subsequently to the City Council, and authorize the General Manager of the Department of Animal Services to execute the subject Agreement upon receipt of necessary approvals.

SUMMARY
The Department has been utilizing a free email marketing tool called Simple Send that is outdated and has limited functionality and features. As the Department continues to increase brand awareness, present a positive image, and become a resource and service for the community, a more robust email marketing software system is needed. Email marketing is a great tool to communicate with the Department’s audience (media, donors, volunteers, partners, community members) regarding pet adoption, spay/neuter, programs/services, pet laws and safety, animal related tips and resources and achievements and goals.
The Department reviewed three different email marketing services Constant Contact, MailChimp and Benchmark Email. The review included a comparison of cost, ease of email creation, available features and customer support. Based on the evaluation, the Department is recommending purchasing the email marketing software by Constant Contact. The software is user-friendly and offers advanced features. The company also offers a technical service representative to assist in email template creation, email list building and other technical support.

Benchmark Email provides easy to use drag and drop email templates and customer service support but their emails do not offer as much customization options or features as Constant Contact. They also require additional technical steps the Department would need to take in order to avoid emails from going into subscribers' spam folders.

MailChimp’s software is user-friendly and has similar features to Constant Contact but their customer support is weak and it was difficult to get in touch with a person.

All three email marketing services have comparable costs for 10,000 subscribers, which is the approximate size of the current Department email list.

BACKGROUND
Constant Contact is an award-winning company that has been serving organizations and helping them with email marketing and online services for over 15 years.

Proposed Services
Constant Contact Email Plus: 1) Send unlimited emails with customizable branded template 2) Email sign-ups through website and social media, 3) Tracking and reporting, and 4) Additional features: surveys and polls, event sign-up and donation collection

Monthly Cost vs. Yearly Cost
The month to month cost to purchase the software with 10,000 subscribers is $115.00/monthly, total cost annually $1,380.00. The prepaid cost for the year to purchase the software with 10,000 subscribers is $80.50/monthly, total cost annually $966.00. A contract agreement is not required and the Department can cancel the service at any time. The cost is based on 10,000 email subscribers. After the list grows over 10,000, the month to month cost will increase by $41.

GENERAL TERMS
The Department is proposing an agreement as outlined below:

- Terms of agreement:
  - Starting date: July 1, 2016
  - Agreement: 1 year
  - Extensions: Five (5) one–year extensions at Department discretion
  - Ending date: June 31, 2021, if all renewal options are executed
  - Amount: The range of cost for fiscal year 2016-17 is $966.00 - $1,872.00. The minimum cost is based on 10,000 subscribers prepaid and the maximum cost is based on 10,001-25,000 subscribers.
• Billing and Payment: Month to Month or One payment for the year billed and paid by credit card, direct bill pay through bank or by check.

Approved:

Brenda Barnette, General Manager

BOARD ACTION:

_______ Passed  Disapproved  _______

_______ Passed with noted modifications  Continued  _______

_______ Tabled  New Date  _______